



Scottish Community
Safety Network

Preventative Spend Cost Benefit Toolkit

Measuring Preventative Spend – A Cost Toolkit for Community Safety

Introduction

Preventative spending, such as investment into prevention and intervention programmes, is seen by many as being the best economic and social long term investment for the future as it reduces dependency and cost to services in later years.

The Commission on the Future Delivery of Public Services, also known as the Christie Commission was established to develop recommendations for the future delivery of public services in Scotland. One of the Commission's four key objectives is "prioritising prevention, reducing inequalities and promoting equality".

It is evident that preventative spending is seen as the way forward; however a number of challenges have been highlighted which will need to be overcome and worked with to ensure it is a success. One such challenge is in evaluating preventative spend measures, including evidencing the impact of investing in preventative spend by calculating the cost-benefit ratio. This toolkit and associated SCSN training, aims to support officers to demonstrate the cost benefits of local and national initiatives.

Measuring the benefit

The first real effort to understand the economic cost of crime as a per unit cost in the UK was undertaken by the Home Office in the late 1990s/early 2000s, with updates published in 2003/04 and 2010/11. The economic cost of fire in England was also calculated in 2004 and parts updated in 2006 and 2008 by the Department for Communities and Local Government.

The aforementioned have inspired work in Scotland to produce similar costs for Scotland - a number of organisations or programmes have been involved such as the Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents (RoSPA), Transport Scotland, Scottish Government Justice Analytical Services, Audit Scotland, Glasgow's 'Persistent Offender Project' and 'West Lothian's Families Included'. Some of these used the England and Wales figures as a starting point (for example the Scottish Government's 'Economic cost of crime' figures converted the Home Office crime classifications to Scottish ones).

This document is the first to draw all the available data on the economic cost per unit of community safety data in Scotland and can be used to evaluate the cost-benefit of their preventative spend investment. It is also available in an Excel format. Where work is carried out by officers as part of their normal role, calculations of per unit costs are typically done by identifying all the people likely to be involved (for example in a court case), averaging their salaries and averaging the time spent on each case, to come up with an approximate estimate.

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
Audit Scotland Reducing Reoffending 2012 ¹	Probation orders	£1613 [£961-2887]	Scotland
	Submitting social work report for court	£337 [£185-599]	
Audit Scotland Criminal Justice System Overview 2011 ²	Legal aid summary case	£642	Scotland
	Legal aid solemn case	£3194	
	Parole board decision – interview	£115	
	Parole board decision – complex case	£1000	
	Summary case from crime to	£2148	
Scottish Government 2008 figures cited in The societal cost of alcohol misuse 2007 ³	Supervised attendance order	£476	Scotland
	Restriction of liberty order	£9,711	

1 http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/docs/central/2012/nr_121107_reducing_reoffending.pdf

2 http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/docs/central/2011/nr_110906_justice_overview.pdf.

3 <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/297819/0092744.pdf>

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
<p>Information on young people and the criminal justice system Little information is available on the cost of interventions with young people or the cost of restorative justice or costs in relation to the Scottish Children's Reporter Administration (SCRA). Similarly, there is scant information on the cost of case conferences for example – these would need to be calculated on the basis of the average length of a case conference (preparation to follow-up) and per hour cost of each staff involved in the preparation, conference and follow-up.</p> <p>Note that many of these early intervention and prevention programmes have already been evaluated – for example whole systems approach, Early and Effective Intervention (EEI), restorative justice, community payback etc - and due to the cost savings involved already are deemed best practice.</p>			
Audit Scotland Getting it right for children in residential care 2010 ⁴	Residential care for a looked after child/young person annually	£156,250	Scotland. Costs vary widely due to the specific needs of the young person being looked after.
	Residential unit (including crisis care) per week	£1,570 – 5,490	
	Residential school per week	£790 – 4,530	
	Secure care	£3,190 – 5,390	
Cost of Foster Care in the UK – Loughborough University 2010 ⁵	Overall average weekly unit cost	£700	Scotland
Financial Impact of Early Years Interventions in Scotland 2010 ⁶	Additional per year per child cost to the public purse in Scotland of a young person with severe additional needs	£37,400 (2009 prices)	-
	Additional per year per child cost to the public purse in Scotland of a young person with moderate additional needs	£5,100	
Audit Scotland report – Dealing with offending by young people 2002 ⁷	Children's Hearing cost 2002	£645	Scotland. This may change once the new Children's Hearings Act (Scotland) 2011 goes live on 24 June 2013.

4 http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/docs/local/2010/nr_100902_children_residential.pdf

5 http://www.lboro.ac.uk/research/ccfr/Publications/update_cost_foster_care.pdf

6 <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/920/0107869.pdf>

7 www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/docs/.../nr_021204_youth_justice.pdf

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
Early and Effective Intervention implementation costs ⁸ (average from 3 pilot areas) 2009	£25,666		Scotland. No more information within the evaluation regarding costs associated with EEI.
Audit Scotland Commissioning Social Care report 2012 ⁹	Total spending on social work per head of population	Range £534 - £907. > £907 in the three island councils	Scotland.
RoSPA 2010 Home accident report ¹⁰ (2009 prices)	Home accidental fatality	£1,611,400	
	Home accident serious injury	£45,600	
	Home accident slight injury (hospital treated)	£8,300	UK
	Home accident slight injury (GP treated)	£200	

8 <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/254429/0081715.pdf>

9 http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/docs/health/2012/nr_120301_social_care.pdf

10 <http://www.rospa.com/homesafety/Info/re-valuation.pdf>

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments												
	<p>Estimated cost per home accident casualty by age group: June 2009 prices</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Age group</th> <th>Serious</th> <th>Average non fatal (hospital treated)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0-4</td> <td>£33,200</td> <td>£10,600</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5-14</td> <td>£35,300</td> <td>£11,900</td> </tr> <tr> <td>15+</td> <td>£51,300</td> <td>£19,800</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Values rounded to the nearest £100</p>	Age group	Serious	Average non fatal (hospital treated)	0-4	£33,200	£10,600	5-14	£35,300	£11,900	15+	£51,300	£19,800		
Age group	Serious	Average non fatal (hospital treated)													
0-4	£33,200	£10,600													
5-14	£35,300	£11,900													
15+	£51,300	£19,800													
Reported Road Casualties Scotland 2011 ¹¹	Road accident fatality	£1,938,455 (Ranges from £1,678,225 on a motorway to £2,013,425 on a non-built up road)	Scotland												
	Road accident serious injury	£214,563 (Ranges from £201,995 on a built up road to £229,863 on a non-built up road)													
	Road accident slight injury	£21,578 (Ranges from £20,250 on a built up road to £28,080 on a motorway)													
	Road accident damage only	£2,052 (Ranges from £1,865 on a built up road to £2,744 on a non-built up road)													
	Average cost of an A&E attendance	£104 [Ranges from £90 to £190 – price increases with increased rurality]													
NHS Scotland book of costs 2012 ¹²			-												

11 http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/files/Reported_Road_Casualties_Scotland_2011_web_version.pdf
12 <http://www.isdsotland.org/Health-Topics/Finance/Publications/2012-11-27/2012-11-27-Costs-Report.pdf?%418398619>

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
	Average attendance at outpatient clinic	£120	
	Average per day cost of a bed in an acute hospital (non-psychiatric)	£569	
	Cost of treatment as surgical inpatient	£3,138	
	Average GP or Practice Nurse (PN) consultation	£32	More detail on the total number of estimated incidents of these attributed to alcohol misuse can be found within the full report
	Average per day cost of a psychiatric bed	£315.57	
The societal cost of alcohol misuse 2007 ¹³	A sixth of local authority and NHS expenditure is directly on alcohol-related services	£dependent on total expenditure	Per unit costs for spending on drug and alcohol services are not readily available.
	Cost of custody for alcohol-specific arrest	£141 short stay - £385 longer/ overnight stay	England only 2007/08 – Scottish figures are not available
DTTO pilot evaluation 2010 ¹⁴	DTTO start up per client	£2,601	
	Average DTTO cost per client	£8,396	Edinburgh, Midlothian and East Lothian pilot
Sex offenders	<p>Registered Sex Offenders</p> <p>Costs for managing Registered Sex Offenders (RSOs) are not readily available, however researchers have demonstrated through cost-benefit analyses that the costs associated with sex offender recidivism greatly exceed the costs associated with providing intervention.</p> <p>On-going management of sex offenders in the community is the responsibility of a variable number of staff from the Police and local authority and calculation of cost per RSO was not undertaken within the Audit Scotland Reducing Reoffending 2012 due to time constraints. Other similar costings have been calculated by Audit Scotland by identifying all the people likely to be involved, averaged their salaries and averaged the time spent on x, to come up with a (rough) estimate. CSPs would be able to use this methodology to calculate these locally.</p>		

13 <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/297819/0092744.pdf>

14 <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/310418/0097967.pdf>

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
	Circles of support and accountability per offender per year ¹⁵	£9,000	Thames Valley pilot
Scottish Prison Service Annual Report 2011/12 ¹⁶	Annual cost of prison for one prisoner	£32,371	Scotland
	Cost of electronic tagging monitoring (per day per tag)	£13.14	
Offender management – reducing reoffending	Cost per woman under Women in Focus mentoring programme ¹⁷	£1,698	From South West Scotland CJA – 2011 evaluation report for 'Women in focus' mentoring programme. Based on 980 worker contacts per year per individual.
Scottish Government Economists 2012 ¹⁸ – this was used within the Glasgow Persistent Offender's Project cost-benefit evaluation too and uses the Home Office cost of crime calculations and converts them to Scottish crime types	Rape & attempted rape	£88,731	Based on the calculations within the Home Office report, but part of an on-going project within SG Justice Analytical Services. Costs for aggravated offences such as domestic abuse, child victim, human trafficking, organised crime and hate crime are not given separately however the cost of the offence type (irrespective of the aggravator) could be used. However it is worth noting the cost for an aggravated offence (both in processing it through the criminal justice system and the cost of the impact on the victim(s) is likely to be greater than for the same non-aggravated offence, though to what degree is unclear.
		£28,726	
		£2,072	
	Crimes of indecency	£24,719	
	Other indecency	£8,403	
	Serious Assault	£9,296	
	Robbery	£3,770 / £3,427 / £3,427	
	Other non-sexual crimes of violence		
	Housebreaking Domestic dwelling / Domestic non-dwelling / Other		
	Crimes of dishonesty		

15 www.cjsotland.org.uk/Commappnonsexoffenders.doc

16 <http://www.sps.gov.uk/Publications/Publication-4158.aspx>

17 <http://www.sccjr.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2012/10/Women%20in%20Focus%20FINAL%20REPORT.pdf>

18 PowerPoint presentation delivered at the March 2012 Crime and Justice statistics user day. <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Statistics/Browse/Crime-Justice/scotstatcrime/invite/Session1>

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
	Theft by OLP motor vehicle	£731	
	Theft by OLP non-motor vehicle / Theft from motor vehicle not classified elsewhere	£990	
	Theft of a Motor Vehicle	£4,774	
	Att theft of motor vehicle	£589	
	Shoplifting (1999 figure)	£127	
	Theft not classified as any of the above	£731	
	Minor Assault	£6,700	
	Minor assault of emergency worker	£1,661	
	Breach of the Peace		
	Drunkenness	£2,072	
	Other misc offences		
	Crimes against public justice		
	Handling an offensive weapon	£2,072	
	Drugs		
	Other crimes		

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments						
	<table border="1"> <tr> <td rowspan="3">Damage</td> <td>Fire-raising</td> <td rowspan="3">£999</td> <td rowspan="3"></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vandalism</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Other malicious mischief offences</td> </tr> </table>	Damage	Fire-raising	£999		Vandalism	Other malicious mischief offences		
Damage	Fire-raising		£999						
	Vandalism								
	Other malicious mischief offences								
Cost of domestic violence 2009 ¹⁹	Domestic abuse (average incident)	£25,560							
Scottish Government Economists 2012 ²⁰	Average cost per prolific (3 previous) offender	£180,000	Unclear exactly what costs these are – awaiting an update from Scottish Government						
	Average cost per very short term offender (< 6 months)	£277,000							
	Average cost per long term (> 4 years) offender	£147,000							
Audit Scotland	Hourly cost of a police officer	£22.94	This figure has already been incorporated into the economic cost of crime figures, however is included in case of local need to demonstrate police officer costs within local initiatives.						
Antisocial Behaviour costs ²¹	Antisocial Behaviour Per unit call out costs for environment officers or noise nuisance teams or other ASB unit costs such as graffiti removal have not been calculated for Scotland – it is part of their normal role and could be calculated locally using the method outlined in the introduction.								
	Mediation cost 2003 (average)	£121	Scotland. Note the date on the figures.						

19 http://www.google.co.uk/url?sa=t&rc1=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=4&ved=0CEkQFjAD&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.lancs.ac.uk%2Ffass%2Fdoc_library%2Fsociology%2Fcost_of_domestic_violence_update.doc&ei=pgNLUY_ellqHtQbmh4CwBg&usq=AFQjCNH0ZVC6MjTdfPrSE0iD0KEHTwG6Q&bvm=bv.44158598.d.Yms

20 As 16

21 <http://www.irf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/2181-antisocial-scotland-housing.pdf> and Cyrennians report at http://www.cyrennians.org.uk/wmslib/PDFs/amber_report_final.pdf

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
Legal intervention case 2003	Total average	£3,456	England. Note the date on the figures.
	Eviction	£9,029	
	Antisocial Behaviour Order (ASBO)	£2,247	
	Interdict	£1,281	
	Warning letter	£66	
	Penalty notice	£74	
	Acceptable Behaviour Contract (ABC)	£230	
	Injunction	£1,600	
	Prosecution for ASBO breach	£1,500	
	Cost of abandoned vehicle disposal	£60-£100	
2006 National Audit Office	Average cost of tenancy failure	£1,610 - £4,210	Scotland
	Homelessness case	£15,000 (simple) - £83,000 (complex)	
Jill Dando Institute 2003	Processing a homeless application	£558 (average)	England
	Temporary accommodation per week	£74 - £214	Average temporary accommodation lasted 30 weeks in Scotland 2010/11. Please consider these costs with due regard to the new homelessness prevention requirements in Scotland – temporary accommodation costs overall are anticipated to reduce as the new prevention strategy should reduce the requirement for local authorities to use temporary accommodation.
2009 Cyrennians report.	Possession hearings	£500 to in excess of £10,000	Costs vary widely according to whether in-house or commercial solicitors are used, the complexity of the case and whether the case is contested.

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments	
Economic Cost of Fire ²²	No analysis has been carried out into the economic cost of fire in Scotland – the figures below are from calculations done for England in 2003. Other economic costs are included in later reports – 2006 and 2008 – but the former only covers arson and the latter only a small number of per unit costs. Awaiting an update from the SG about the economic cost of fire in Scotland.			
	Deliberate fire	£999	From SG economists' 'economic cost of crime' work 2012	
	Resource costs in response to deliberate fire and malicious false alarms	£3,120 [Ranges from £2,699 to £3,771]	Economic cost of fire 2008 – England only. There are other figures contained within the report, however these are only estimates for the average cost per fire which is insufficiently specific to use. The figures in this table do not include average damage costs for this type of incident.	
	Marginal cost for a false alarm	£70.57 [Ranges from £61 to £96]		
	Deliberate fires – response and consequential (including human, property, criminal justice & lost business costs). Breakdowns are available on pg 38 of the report. These calculations differ from non-	All fires	£5,520	Economic cost of fire 2004, DCLG. Caveats:
		All primary fires	£12,890	• This was calculated for England and Wales only and may not correspond to actual costs in Scotland, particularly when there can be much higher operating cost for FRS in Scotland – five of the Scottish services are among the six most expensive in the UK (for which reasons are unclear though rurality and therefore higher transport costs and higher incident levels may explain some of this). This would predominantly affect the response cost rather than the consequential cost, but it is unhelpful to only look at the consequential response in Scotland without any response cost. In time hopefully consequential and response costs will be calculated for Scotland, however in the meantime using the joint costs for Scotland may be preferable to having no costs or simply using the consequential costs.
		All primary fires (excl. vehicles)	£26,140	
		Building	£31,130	
		Domestic	£22,010	
		Commercial	£48,330	
Public sector		£46,150		
Vehicle (excl. derelict)	£4,660			
Outdoor secondary	£1,970			

²² http://www.lothian.fire-uk.org/IMAGES/Scotland_Together.pdf and the figures from Department of Communities and Local Government 2008. are replicated at <http://www.strathclydefire.org/about-us/planning-and-performance/economic-cost-of-fire.aspx>

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
<p>Non-deliberate fires – response and consequential (including human, property & lost business) costs. Breakdowns and more extensive property classifications are available on pgs 41, 43 & 44 of the report</p> <p>Fatalities and Injuries – human costs only</p>	All incidents	£5,500	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In the short run, the marginal cost of attending an additional fire is likely to be significantly below the average cost, since the FRS operates with sufficient spare capacity to enable them to respond to every incident. Therefore caution should be exercised in assuming that the cost of response would be a realisable saving in the event of preventing a given number of fires. <li>• In the long run, some response cost savings may be realisable as a result of fewer fires but as a general rule, we do not recommend the use of the cost of response figures in determining the size of any savings to be made from preventative work. A more appropriate approach would be to approximate the savings from lower costs associated with a reduced use of retained fire fighters and any other savings that can be made from fewer callouts (i.e. less maintenance costs of vehicles). <p>Taken from the Government's Economic Cost of Fire 2004 report – the base figures for 'human costs' are explained within the document but essentially comprise healthcare costs, lost output and emotional & physical suffering. They are based on the figures calculated by the Department of Transport in relation to road casualties.</p> <p>To accurately assess the cost of these types of fires, response and other costs would need to be added to these (depending on the building type and other damage etc) to accurately calculate the total cost of a fatal fire. This can be done using the 2004 report. Here for simplicity you can add £4083 to the total cost to reflect the 'average fire' figures (response, property damage and criminal justice costs).</p>
	All fires	£9,000	
	All primary fires	£18,500	
	Building	£30,300	
	Domestic	£25,000	
	Commercial	£43,800	
	Agricultural	£65,200	
	Industrial	£45,800	
	Trade	£41,200	
	Public sector	£40,200	
	Other buildings	£38,200	
	Vehicles	£4,400	
	Non building excl vehicles	£2,600	
	Outdoor primary	£13,200	
	Outdoor secondary	£2,000	
	Fatality	£1,375m	
Serious injury (all burns and 1 in 4 smoke inhalation)	£155,000		
Slight injury (all others not included above)	£12,000		

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
NHS Scotland Costs Book ²³	Alcohol Brief Intervention	£25	Scotland
	Murder – CMO 2006 report	£1.3million	
Chief Medical Officer's Report 2006 ²⁴	Serious Assault – CMO 2006 report	£19,000	Total – not just the health costs. The same report gives a figure of 3-6% of total NHS budget spent on treating violence = £400million (no detail re cost per incident)
	CHN1 - Cost Per Primary School Pupil	4899.41	
Improvement Service Local Government Benchmarking Framework	CHN2 - Cost per Secondary School Pupil	6515.72	Scotland 3year average from 2010/11 to 2012/13.
	CHN3 - Cost per Pre-School Education Registration	3250.11	
	CORP 4 - The cost per dwelling of collecting Council Tax	13.69	
	SW1 - Older Persons (Over65) Home Care Costs per Hour	20.22	
	SW5 - Older persons (over 65's) Residential Care Costs per week per resident	394.21	
	C&L1 - Cost per attendance at Sports facilities	4.29	
	C&L2 - Cost Per Library Visit	3.52	
	C&L3 - Cost of Museums per Visit	4.29	
	C&L4 - Cost of Parks& Open Spaces per 1,000 Population	35017.29	
	ENV1 - Gross cost of Waste collection per premises	82.70	

²³ <http://www.isdscotland.org/Health-Topics/Finance/Costs/>

²⁴ <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/203463/0054202.pdf> which uses a 'police research group – England and Wales' as the source

Source	Content	Per Unit Cost(s) [Range if applicable]	Comments
	ENV2 - Gross cost per Waste disposal per premises	106.90	
	ENV3a - Net cost of street cleaning per 1,000 population	19309.49	
	ENV4a - Cost of maintenance per kilometre of roads	6855.98	
	ENV5 - Cost of trading standards and environmental health per 1,000 population	23768.91	



34b Thistle Street, North West Lane

Edinburgh, EH2 1EA

0131 225 8700/7772

Email: info@scsn.org.uk

Company Ltd. SC357649

Charity No. SC040464

www.safercommunitiescotland.org